

---

Rose, Marilyn Gaddis, editor. *Beyond the Western Tradition: Essays on Translation Outside Standard European Languages. Translation Perspectives XI*. Binghamton: Center for Research in Translation, State University of New York at Binghamton, 2000, 436 pp.

---

*Beyond the Western Tradition*, edited by Marilyn Gaddis Rose marks the tenth year of the *Translation Perspectives* series, published periodically at the State University of New York at Binghamton. This volume contains twenty-two separate essays that are organized in five separate sections, each section focusing on a geographical region and the regional issues that are involved when translating. In the brief foreword, Rose expresses the hope that the word *Beyond* in the title will not lead the reader to believe that the book refers to *Outside* or *Non-Western* traditions. Her intent, as editor, is to help the reader understand the distinction between the translation perspectives from the western world and from other parts of the globe.

The sections in the book refer first to translation in general, then, specifically, to approaches in Europe, the Middle East, Africa, Indian Subcontinent and the Far East, and, finally, Latin America. Within each section, the authors discuss the challenges involved when working with cultures and/or languages in a particular region. The book also contains an addendum entitled: "Advice for Translating Between Any Two Natural Languages." Rose included this section in order to supplement previous editions of the journal she edits *Translation Perspectives* as well as to assist the reader in basic translating theory.

In the first section regarding cross-cultural issues, the authors address theories that relate to translating from any language. The first topic addresses the translation of metaphor and the extent to which these figurative forms of speech rely on the culture from which they derive. In his contribution, Edward Gentzler examines whether it is possible to translate metaphors accurately. Joshua Price, in his article "Hybrid Languages, Translation, and Post-Colonial Challenges," discusses the theory that all languages are inter-related and reliant upon each other.

The Europe section focuses on what effect the many migrants that

live in the different countries and speak different languages have on translation. In translation theory one assumes that the translator works into his or her native language from another language. However, this changes when the migrant enters a country and speaks either both languages or neither language fluently. This phenomenon challenges modern translation theory. To discuss these matters, Stephanos Stephanides uses the example of the island of Cyprus, which contains speakers of many different languages and influences from many different cultures, thus affecting translation itself.

When discussing the Middle East and Africa and its languages, the authors involved focus on the Arabic language and how it relates to translation. Two of the articles (by Said Faiq and John Maier) address the declining importance of translation and the translator in the contemporary era, contrasting this reality with the medieval Arab translator who was considered as a critical member of society, remunerated by rulers to translate foreign works with the purpose of maintaining the dominance of the Arabic language. Most of the works translated during the Middle Ages were books of science and math. Very little foreign literature was

translated since, for religious reasons, the presence of ideas from other cultures was considered dangerous. In modern times, affirm Faiq and Maier, the study of translation is not encouraged in the universities of the Middle East even though translation is thought of as a natural extension of multilingualism.

In the section on the Indian Subcontinent and the Far-East, including China, G. Gopinathan addresses the history and rhetoric of translation in ancient India. Gopinathan notes that the ancient literature of India does not contain an explicit theory on translation. One possible reason for this discrepancy, states the author, is the lack of translated foreign literature. In this region, the translation of religious texts in ancient times (not only those of Buddhism and Islam but also of Christianity and Chinese philosophers) affected the cultures and history of the religions involved.

The final section introduces and discusses some concepts that relate to Latin America, including: the problems of translating a bilingual or multilingual text, the translation of indigenous texts, and different translation theories in Latin America (such as those of Brazilian poet and translator Haroldo de Campos,

which appear in the contribution by Eliane Fernanda C. Ferreira). Campos compares the translator to a choreographer, who takes the original text and produces choreography, a “representation of figures and steps to be re-danced,” using a new “body” that follows the format of the original text. Campos also introduces the idea of “fragmentary intertextuality” to describe the process of translation, which entails the dismantling of a text in a source language and its subsequent reassembling in a new language.

The addendum at the end of the book contains texts related to the technical aspects of translation, which include: Copyrighting and Translation, The Use of Translation Terminology, and Permissions (which are necessary when translating a text.) In this section, editor Marilyn Gaddis Rose analyzes translation and whether translating a text (in this case a poem) creates a new work or a repeat of the original text. The articles in this section speak of specific issues that arise in the process of publishing or getting permission to publish a translation.

*Beyond Western Tradition XI* has several potential shortcomings. The introduction is very short and does not assist the reader in understanding the purpose of the texts that were chosen. Also, the separation of the texts according to geographical area is not necessarily an accurate division, since many of the articles include references to regions of the world outside the section in which they appear. The texts included in this compilation all contain a *works cited* section and several have appendices that include additional information. This volume might have been easier to use, however, had the editor compiled the individual works cited pages into a single bibliography, thereby facilitating further reading.

Despite these small issues, *Beyond Western Tradition XI* of the *Translation Perspectives* series is an excellent source of information involving translating languages from many parts of the world. By focusing individually on the regional differences of translation, Marilyn Gaddis Rose offers a wonderful overview of the issues involved when attempting to translate a text.

Adam J. Rounds

Saint Lawrence University

---